COCHIN LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

Wednesday, *the* *24th of February 1932.*
12th of Kumbham 1107.

The House met at half-past Eleven of the clock with the Deputy President in the Chair. Messrs. M. A. Chakko, K. G. Nayar, K. T. Mathew, A. Sankara Menon, A. Sankara Poduval, P. I. Varugis and Dr. A. R. Menon were absent.

QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

Tenders—purchase of medicine.

370. Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Will the Government be pleased to state.—

(a) whether for purchases of medicine made by the Government after the appointment of Dr. Rao as Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer, tenders had been called for in all cases;

(b) if so, were the lowest quotations always accepted;

(c) will the Government kindly place a statement on the table showing the purchases made without calling for tenders, with the date, the amount involved and the source from which the purchase was made in each case?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—(a) No. A list of items for which tenders were not called for is appended. (*Appendix I.*)

(b) Lowest quotations were almost always accepted.

(c) Please see answer to (a) above.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—May I know, Sir, whether before the present incumbent came in as the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer, the General Hospital at Ernakulam was not one of the best equipped institutions in South India?

Deputy President.—Is it not an opinion that you ask of the Government?

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—No, it is a fact. Very many times it has been stated in this House, that it is one of the best equipped institutions in South India. Government themselves said like that. It is not an opinion, it is a fact. May I know whether before the present incumbent came in as the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer the General Hospital at Ernakulam was not one of the best equipped in South India?

Deputy President.—Is it not an opinion ?

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—There cannot be difference of opinion in this matter. It is a matter of fact whether an institution is

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

well equipped or ill-equipped. It is a matter of fact and not an opinion.

Deputy President.—To which part of the question does your supplementary question refer ?

Mr. C.A. Ouseph.—It is a general question. It is a supplementary question to the end of my question. I find that Rs. 6,000 worth of instruments purchased without tenders. May I know whether, as one of the best equipped institutions in South India, the Ernakulam General Hospital had all necessary instruments before the present Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer took charge ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—Even now we have not got all the necessary instruments.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Am I to understand, Sir, that from the year 1100 to 1106 Kumbham, when that institution was passing as one of the best equipped institutions in South India, it was deficient in the supply of instruments ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—We had a fair supply of instruments and no institution in the world can be complete as regards the supply of instruments.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Am I to understand that this condition was necessitated by this thought in the mind of the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer? I find six thousand rupees worth of instruments purchased during the five months without tenders. Was it because that he found that it was absolutely deficient in the supply of instruments ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—For the information of this House I may give this particular information that the instruments purchased were not all intended for the General Hospital alone. Very few of them have been kept in the General Hospital. They were for outlying hospitals also which were deficient in the supply of these instruments.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—May I know whether before these instruments were ordered for, demands were obtained from the outlying hospitals ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—I have been going round on inspection and I found that they were wanting.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Has the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer in his rounds of visit noted in the visitor's book or in the inspection note book kept in the several institutions that they are deficient in instruments and that such and such instruments are necessary ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—It is not necessary. I took notes of what is deficient there and supplied.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Has the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer reported to the Government anything based upon the notes that he has thus taken?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—It is not necessary.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—May I know, before these instruments were ordered, whether any orders have been passed by the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer saying that such and such instruments are necessary ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—No orders have been passed.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—May I know where was the urgency for ordering for these instruments without passing orders ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—The question is not clear.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—The Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer admitted that before ordering for these instruments no orders have been passed that these instruments should be got down. Where was the urgency for getting these instruments without passing orders ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—I do not still understand the the clearness of the question.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—The Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer admits that in his rounds he found certain hospitals deficient in instruments, he admits he took notes and then he ordered for these instruments. I ask whether he has passed any orders in his office saying that such and such instruments are necessary for such and such hospitals? If he has not passed orders where was the urgency to get down the instruments ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—I do not see any necessity for passing such orders.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Am I to understand that the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer can order anything as he likes ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—It is according to the requirements. Itis not a question of my liking. It is a question of what the institutions require.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Is there any paper in the department to show that these institutions require such instruments ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—Sometimes, I think, indents come.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—May I know whether the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer could not have waited for the annual indents ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—The next year's annual indents are in the office.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—That is not an answer for my question. Could you not have waited for the annual indents to arrive ?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—Before the close of the year the instruments had to be purchased or money would lapse.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph —I am sorry that it is not yet the close of the year. He feared that money would lapse and therefore he ordered for these instruments?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—No.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—May I know then where was the hurry ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—It was a necessity.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—What was the necessity? Here again the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer is begging the question. He said that it was necessary, what was the necessity ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—It is during my inspection that I found the institutions lacking in these things and I have supplied the institutions with the necessary articles. I used my opinion.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Was there any objection to ask the officers in charge of the particular institutions to order or send an application or send an indent to the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer for such instruments ? Was there any objection to do that ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—It was not necessary to give them any instructions.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—May I know how many of these have been supplied to the other hospitals?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—I want notice.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Am I right in thinking that not even instruments worth of 1 thousand rupees have gone out of the General Hospital?

Deputy President—The Hon'ble Member wants notice and it does not arise from this.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Where was the objection to call for tenders in ordering for the instruments?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—The instruments of different makers are of different standards and it is a fact known only to medical men. If instruments are purchased on the lowest tender I am sure the Government will be a loser in the long run. The instruments will be of poor qualities. It is therefore in the interest of the Sirkar that tenders were not called for.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Am I to understand that particular instruments are made only by particular individuals and companies ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—There are different manufacturers, but there are certain standard manufacturers who pro-

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

duce articles of approved quality and we have been purchasing articles from these approved manufacturers.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Is the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer aware that in this very Council from 1100 to 1107 objections have several times been raised that the Chief Medical Officer was not calling for tenders and that it was wrong to get supplies without calling for tenders ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—Yes. As such tenders have been called for medicines.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—May I know whether in previous years when instruments have been got down no tenders have been called for ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao —Never.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—May I know whether the instruments have thus been got down are of the best type ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—Yes.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—May I know whether instruments in the hospitals got down previously are of the same make ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—Not all of them.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph. —Am I to understand that they were of inferior quality?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—Certainly not.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Then may I know when particular instruments are manufactured by particular manufacturers why there is no scope for tenders.?

Deputy President.—The C. M. and S. O. said tenders were called for medicine. So this does not arise.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—This is with reference to another answer. The C. M. and S. O. said that particular instruments are made by particular firms. There is no scope for tender because other firms cannot supply these. Now it has been admitted that instruments previously supplied by other firms are equally good. So I ask why he did not call for tenders.

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—We have been getting instruments usually from Messrs. Down Bros., London. There are certain instruments which are manufactured by special makers such as John Weiss and Son for the eye, and there are other instruments for the throat and nose. There are surgical instruments which can be purchased from the German manufacturers cheaply and these are supplied to the mofussil hospitals. In this Department it has been customary to purchase all our necessaries either from Down Brothers or from some of the German manufacturers. It is according to practice and past traditions.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—The C. M. and S. O. said that there is no scope for calling tenders. Am I to understand that the instruments have been got down from the manufacturers themselves or from their selling Agents?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—Mostly.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Am I to understand that Messrs. Malgham Brothers are manufacturers of the instruments concerned?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—They are agents.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Am I not right in saying that Girdhar Jar and Co. are also agents.

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—Yes.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—May I know whether they are sole agents or whether there are other agents to sell the same instruments?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—They are the sole agents in Bombay.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Are there similar instruments made by the same firm sold in Calcutta and Madras?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—Yes.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Where is the objection to call for tenders?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—No objection.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Then they could have been purchased cheaper.

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—I doubt it.

Mr. C.A. Ouseph.—May I know whether Appendix I does not contain a list of medicines purchased?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—There are some.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Why no tenders were called for?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—Things like anti-rabic vaccine, rectified spirit, cinchona febrifuge etc., have not been included and no special reference is made.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—May I know why with regard to stoves for Rs. 400 bought from Shiviji and Co, Madras, no tenders were called for. And again Rs. 130 worth of stoves, why tenders were not called for; They are not very urgent.

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—I wrote to three Firms and I found that their quotations were the lowest.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Was there any objection to call for tenders? That is my objection.

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—It will not be possible to get these articles if we start calling for tenders for all these minor items. It is not one or two items. We have to publish it in the Gazette and we have to send copies to all these people outside,

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

if we are not going to restrict the purchase of articles from State people. The people from whom these articles were purchased were the direct importers of Norwegian Stoves and their prices were the cheapest and hence I indented.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—How many firms ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—Half a dozen.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—In Madras.

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—Some in Madras and others in Bombay.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Did the C. M. and S. O. consult local firms?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—Yes; their prices were higher.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—May I know whether Cinchona is manufactured in Madras ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—Yes, it is.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—May I know why tenders were not called for ?

Dr. D Raghavendra Rao.—Because the Madras Government factory is the cheapest.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—How did the C. M. and S. O. know that it is the cheapest ?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao.—It is the Madras Government factory. It takes only the cost price. They have been the quinine producers and we have been purchasing from them.

Cases—Prosecuting Inspectors.

371. Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Will the Government be pleased to place a statement on the table showing the number of cases the Prosecuting Inspectors of the Northern and Southern Divisions respectively were in charge of on the 1st of Chingam 1107 and on 30th Thulam 1107?

Mr. P. Nilakanta Menon.—A statement is appended. (*Appendix II.*)

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—May I know whether the appendix shows that there is no scope for two Prosecuting Inspectors?

Mr. P. Nilakanta Menon.—For the information of the House I may say that Government have passed orders saying that as an experiment it may be tried with one officer.

Traffic control.

372. Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Will the Government be pleased to state whether they are aware that at present there is a sort of 'dyarchy' in traffic control and that such dyarchy militates against efficient control?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

APPENDIX I.

(Vide Answer to Question No. 370)

List

Date	Secure of supply	Names of articles purchased	Amount Rs.	A.	P.
4— 7—06	Pasteur Institute, Coonoor	Antirabic Vaccine	380	0	0
16— 7—06	Trichur Distillery	Rectified Spirit	159	6	0
27— 7—06	Havero Trading Co., Madras	Sera	65	4	0
1— 8—06	A. R. Prabhu and Bros., Ernakulam	Plates, bowls, etc.	48	12	0
24— 8—06	do	do	56	12	0
Do	Trichur Distillery	Rectified Spirit	6	0	0
Do	Pasteur Institute, Coonoor	Antirabic Vaccine	370	0	0
3— 9—06	Bengal Immunity Co. Ltd , Calcutta	Hypodermic Injections and Sera	84	8	0
6— 9—06	Pasteur Institute, Coonoor	Antirabic Vaccine	1,070	0	0
Do	Shiviji & Co., Madras.	Stoves	104	7	0
7— 9—06	Trichur Distillery	Rectified Spirit	159	6	0
12— 9—06	Malgham Bros., Bombay	Instruments	658	8	0
Do	Spencer & Co. Ltd., Madras	Monsel Liquid	23	10	0
25— 9—06	Valvoline Oil Co., Madras	Wilburine White Jelly	132	0	0
21—10—06	Pasteur Institute, Coonoor	Antirabic Vaccine	230	0	0
27—10—06	Trichur Distillery	Rectified Spirit	207	3	0
6—11—06	Girdhar Javer & Co., Bombay	Instruments, empties, etc.	1,849	7	0
Do	Pasteur Institute, Coonoor	Antirabic Vaccine	110	0	0
12—11—06	Spencer & Co. Ltd., Madras	Candle filter	6	8	0
29—11—06	Koder Esq., Cochin	Bed pans stoves	201	4	0
Do	Shiviji & Co., Madras	Stoves	130	0	0
29—11—06	Spencer & Co., Madras	Candle filter	13	9	0
1—12—06	Trichur Distillery	Rectified Spirit	239	1	0
7—12—06	Pasteur Institute, Coonoor	Antirabic Vaccine	380	0	0
15—12—06	Parry & Co., Ltd., Cochin	Methylated Spirit	156	12	0
Do	Haller's Consulting Room, Madras	Hypodermic Injections	97	0	0
Do	Girdhar Javer& Co., Bombay	Instruments	543	6	0

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

APPENDIX I—(*cont.*)

Date	Source of supply	Names of articles purchased	Amount
			£. sh. d.
15—12—06	Mayer and Pelps, London	Instruments	25 4 0
			Rs. A. P.
21—12—06	May & Baker (India) Ltd., Calcutta	Hypodermic Injections	72 14 0
22—12—06	Trichur Distillery	Rectified Spirit	191 4 0
24—12—06	United Rubber Export Co., Calcutta	Rubber goods	666 14 0
Do	A. R. Prabhu & Bros. and Kunjuvareed & Co., Ernakulam	Sundry articles	16 14 0
Do	Mangalam Vareed, Trichur	Bed pans	42 0 0
Do	Pasteur Institute, Coonoor	Antirabic Vaccine	400 0 0
15— 1—07	Velayudhan, Ernakulam	Hot water Sterilizers	150 0 0
17— 1—07	R. V. Kamath & Co., Cochin	X'Ray films	322 0 0
6— 2—07	Tata Oil Mills, Ltd., Ernakulam	Iron barrel	17 0 0
Do	Bengal Immunity Co. Ltd., Calcutta	Bili Vaccine	13 9 0
Do	G. Loucatos & Co., Calcutta	do	176 12 0
Do	Haller's Consulting Room, Madras	Narcotic Hypodermic Injections	82 8 0
Do	Penitentiary do	Cinchona Febrifuge	543 4 0
Do	May & Baker (India) Ltd., Madras	Extracts of Tinctures (samples)	144 0 0
Do	Pasteur Institute, Coonoor	Antirabic Vaccine	180 0 0
			£. sh. d.
Do	Down Bros. Ltd., London	Instruments	2 11 5
			Rs. A. P.
Do	Shivji & Co., Madras	Stoves	400 6 0
Do	G. Loucatos & Co., Calcutta	Bili Vaccine	25 8 0
Do	I. C. & Co., Trichur	Paddy husk	15 10 0
			£. sh. d.
Do	Down Bros. Ltd., London	Instruments	114 17 9
			Rs. A. P.
26— 2—07	Mangalam Vareed, Trichur	Bed pans	42 0 0
10— 3—07	Prominent Surgical Co., Sialkot	Instruments	326 12 0
Do	Pasteur Institue, Coonoor	Antirabic Vaccine	460 0 0

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

APPENDIX I—(*cont.*)

Date	Source of supply	Names of articles purchased	Amount
			Rs. A. P.
10— 3—07	Tata Oil Mills Ltd., Ernakulam	Tins	70 12 0
17— 3—07	Bengal Immunity Co. Ltd., Calcutta	Bili Vaccine	66 4 0
Do	Powell & Co., Bombay	Instruments	39 8 0
Do	Tata Oil Mills Ltd., Ernakulam	Marotti Oil	17 8 0
Do	Jack & Co., Bombay	Instruments, etc.	370 2 0
Do	Rangildas Sunderdas & Co., Bombay	Laboratory articles	146 8 0
1— 4—07	Trichur Distillery	Rectified Spirit	191 4 0
Do	R. V. Kamath & Co., Cochin	X'Ray films	442 2 0
7— 4—07	Pasteur Institute, Coonoor	Antirabic Vaccine	530 0 0
Do	Valvoline Oil Co, Madras	Wilburine White Jelly	324 12 9
Do	Penitentiary, Madras	Cinchona Febrifuge	453 8 0
8— 4—07	Tata Oil Mills Ltd., Ernakulam	Tins	17 6 0
Do	Natham & Co., Cochin	Corks	5 4 0
			£. sh. d.
26— 4—07	Down Bros. Ltd., London	Instruments	55 11 6
			Rs. A P
Do	G. Loucatos and Co., Calcutta	Bili Vaccine	157 0 0
Do	Down Bros. (India) Ltd., Calcutta	Instruments	31 0 0
Do	Caledonian Brush Works, Calcutta	Brushes	19 2 0

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly